

22 January 2010

Jeremy Content  
Planning and Regeneration  
Cornwall Council  
St Clare  
Penzance  
Cornwall  
TR18 3QW

jeremy.content@penwith.gov.uk

Our ref: CSE-19213



Dear Jeremy Content

**CORNWALL COUNCIL: SOUTH QUAY, HAYLE HARBOUR  
PLANNING APPLICATION REFERENCE: 09-1334-ORM**

Thank you for consulting the Commission for Architecture and the Built Environment (CABE) about this proposal. Following a site visit, a meeting with the design team and discussion with the local authority, the planning application drawings and design and access statement were considered at an internal review meeting on 18 January 2010 chaired by MJ Long, with panel member Paul Appleton, and design review staff. CABE's views, which supersede all views that may have been expressed previously, are set out below. This is our formal response to the planning application.

*Summary*

We strongly object to this planning application. We would support retail proposals within the town of Hayle rather than on its edge, and have no objection to the principle of retail activity on this specific site. However, this proposal is designed with an out-of-town retail park approach which is not appropriate to a town centre location or the unique historic and coastal character of this site. Notwithstanding this concern we do not think that a planning application for a single building in this location should be considered in outline. Because our concerns about the scheme are fundamental we have not commented on the principles of appearance and landscaping; this should not be read as an endorsement of the illustrative design.

### *Relationship to the Hayle Harbour masterplan*

South Quay may indeed be the most appropriate part of Hayle Harbour for the first phase of regeneration because of its proximity to the existing town centre.

However, this proposal is a fundamental departure from the approved Hayle Harbour masterplan prepared by the same developer. Although we had significant reservations about the form of the proposals for South Quay that were part of that masterplan, this new application goes against all the sound aspirations expressed within that application for an intimate scale, mixed-use development that is well connected to the town centre.



### *Site layout*

The out-of-town retail approach for South Quay has the following negative implications. The single use generates three inactive edges to the store. The large retail shed has a scale and grain that does not integrate with other development in the centre of Hayle or Hayle Harbour, either existing or proposed by the approved masterplan. There is a lack of synergy between the developments on either side of the viaduct; this will not feel like an extension of the town centre. The proposal does not generate a meaningful connection to the existing town or acknowledge likely pedestrian desire lines. The link to the town centre via Foundry Square remains tortuous and the need to improve the important route to the railway station has not been acknowledged. The Quay is separated from the town centre by the intervention of the large surface car park which we do not believe can ever function as a new public open space. The separation is compounded by the omission of all of the connecting bridges proposed in the master plan.

Any development on South Quay needs acknowledge its special qualities: the varied waterfront conditions, the viaduct and the history of the town of Hayle and its designation as a World Heritage Site. A special bespoke solution that draws on these qualities and responds to the specific character of its location is necessary. This site presents many exiting opportunities for regeneration that the application does not begin to address.

### *Conclusion*

Overall, this is a very challenging site on which to design a supermarket of this scale. An out-of-town style store is not appropriate. A fundamentally different site specific, urban approach will be needed to resolve these challenges convincingly and we urge the local authority to refuse this application.

Yours sincerely



Louise Newman  
Senior design review advisor  
lnewman@cabe.org.uk



cc     Alan Gaskell             Mountford Pigott  
         Simon Ramsden         English Heritage  
         Thoss Shearer             Government Office for the South West

**Declaration of interest**

Liz Peace is a CABE commissioner and is also chief executive of the British Property Federation. In this role, she does not have direct involvement in development schemes proposed by Federation members.

**Public scheme**

As this scheme is the subject of a planning application, we will publish our views on our website, [www.cabe.org.uk](http://www.cabe.org.uk)

**Regional Affiliation**

CABE is affiliated with independent regional design review panels, which commits them all to shared values of service, the foundation of which are the 10 key principles for design review. Further information on affiliation can be found by visiting our website: [www.cabe.org.uk/design-review/regional](http://www.cabe.org.uk/design-review/regional)