

RAMSDEN, Simon

From: RAMSDEN, Simon
Sent: 28 January 2011 15:14
To: 'Content Jeremy'
Cc: Cahill Nick
Subject: Hayle Harbour

Dear Jeremy

Thank you for providing your notes on the public meeting held on Wednesday 19th January 2011, and for indicating that we can find *Hayle Supermarkets- Comments and Issues arising from the Strategic Planning Committee's Public Meeting- 19th January 2011* on the Council's website.

I understand that not everyone at that meeting may have seen our response (dated, and emailed to you, on the 18th January 2011) to the current applications, or had time to fully study their contents. Likewise, they may not have had CABE's comments (dated 19 January 2011) which states "In light of the shortcomings in the design and site planning noted above we are unable to support the application in its current form." Obviously, they would not have had Cornwall Council's Historic Environment's comments, dated 21 January 2011, which outlines their "fundamental issues of concern."

Your **notes** of the meeting (and we accept that they are *your notes* and not formal minutes) indicate that a "Need to resolve English Heritage issues" was discussed. English Heritage has consistently raised concerns regarding the basic approach to the site at South Quay, which we (along with others) do not consider to be based on a full understanding, appreciation and response to the historic context in which it sits. Those concerns have not been addressed prior to these applications being submitted, hence our objection. Given the nature and significance of those concerns we do not believe it possible to "resolve" those concerns within the form of the current applications.

It is unclear from your website whether the document ***Hayle Supermarkets- Comments and Issues arising from the Strategic Planning Committee's Public Meeting- 19th January 2011*** is a record of the meeting (in which case it may be factually correct record) or whether these responses were prepared subsequently, in order to answer questions raised on the night in a full and considered manner. It would be useful if this could be clarified on the website to prevent misunderstanding. At present the link is titled "Latest on Hayle Supermarkets", and the document is being interpreted by some as being Cornwall Council's definitive answers to the questions contained in it.

If it is the latter, then the answer to question 6 is of greater concern, relating as it does to the effect on the WHS and listed buildings of the ING proposals. Whilst it is correct that policies in PPS5 should be used in an assessment of the proposals, the answer focuses exclusively on a limited field of assessment criteria from PPS5, and goes on to state "In this respect the [ING] scheme may be considered appropriate." In our view, this selective approach is incorrect, as are any conclusions resulting from it. We also understand that the responses contained within the document were not prepared with reference to Cornwall Council's own Historic Environment Service, which would again raise concerns.

PPS5 is clearly important guidance document, but it would be incorrect to focus on such limited elements of it. Our formal response, of the 18 January 2011, also highlights (as

does the response from Cornwall Council HES) other policies and guidance, such as Circular 07/09, the WHS Management Plan, as well as relevant comments from UNESCO relating to the inscription of the WHS and its Outstanding Universal Value, which are material considerations when assessing such applications.

I am sure you would agree it is essential that the public and elected members are presented with all policies and issues relating to the historic environment, as well as the full, considered responses of statutory consultees, in an accurate and balanced manner, and I trust this will happen in your report.

You will note that ICOMOS have provided comments today and have also written to object to the proposals, as being harmful to the Cornwall & West Devon Mining Landscape World Heritage Site. The implications with regards to ICOMOS, UNESCO and possible threat to WHS status are outlined in Cornwall Council HES's letter.

Regards
Simon

Simon Ramsden
Team Leader: Devon, Cornwall and Isles of Scilly Team
English Heritage
29 Queen Square
Bristol
BS1 4ND

e simon.ramsden@english-heritage.org.uk
t 0117 975 0676
f 0117 975 0701
m 07776 138 605